

# **Nutrient Requirements Shape the Preferential Habitat of Allorhizobium vitis VAR03-1, a Commensal Bacterium, in the Rhizosphere of Arabidopsis thaliana**

Ni[a](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1641-0261)rsi Merry Hemelda $\mathbf{O}^{1,2}$  $\mathbf{O}^{1,2}$  $\mathbf{O}^{1,2}$  $\mathbf{O}^{1,2}$ , Jiyuan Bao $^1$ , Megumi Watanabe $^1$ , Hidenori Matsui $\mathbf{O}^{1}$ , Kazuhiro Toyoda $^1$ , Yuki Ichinos[e](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7767-7912)®<sup>[1](#page-0-0)</sup> and Yoshiteru Noutoshi®<sup>[1,](#page-0-0)</sup>[\\*](#page-0-2)

<span id="page-0-0"></span><sup>1</sup>Graduate School of Environmental, Life, Natural Science and Technology, Okayama University, Tsushima-naka, Kita-ku, Okayama, 700-8530 Japan <sup>2</sup>Department of Biology, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, University of Indonesia, Depok 16424, Indonesia

<span id="page-0-1"></span>\*Corresponding author: E-mail, [noutoshi@okayama-u.ac.jp](mailto:noutoshi@okayama-u.ac.jp)

<span id="page-0-2"></span>(Received 3 May 2024; Accepted 23 August 2024)

**A diverse range of commensal bacteria inhabit the rhizosphere, infuencing host plant growth and responses to biotic and abiotic stresses. While root-released nutrients can defne soil microbial habitats, the bacterial factors involved in plant–microbe interactions are not well characterized. In this study, we investigated the colonization patterns of two plant disease biocontrol agents, Allorhizobium vitis VAR03-1 and Pseudomonas protegens Cab57, in the rhizosphere of Arabidopsis thaliana using Murashige and Skoog (MS) agar medium. VAR03-1 formed colonies even at a distance from the roots, preferentially in the upper**  part, while Cab57 colonized only the root surface. The **addition of sucrose to the agar medium resulted in excessive proliferation of VAR03-1, similar to its pattern without sucrose, whereas Cab57 formed colonies only near the root surface. Overgrowth of both bacterial strains upon nutrient supplementation inhibited host growth, independent**  of plant immune responses. This inhibition was reduced **in the VAR03-1 recA mutant, which exhibited increased bioflm formation, suggesting that some activities associated with the free-living lifestyle rather than the sessile lifestyle may be detrimental to host growth. VAR03- 1 grew in liquid MS medium with sucrose alone, while Cab57 required both sucrose and organic acids. Supplementation of sugars and organic acids allowed both bacterial strains to grow near and away from Arabidopsis roots in MS agar. These results suggest that nutrient requirements for bacterial growth may determine their growth habitats in the rhizosphere, with nutrients released in root exudates potentially acting as a limiting factor in harnessing microbiota.**

**Keywords:** Commensal bacteria • Nutrient requirements • Organic acids • Plant–microbe interactions • Rhizosphere • Sugars

#### **Introduction**

Plants harbor a diverse microbial community encompassing symbionts, commensals and pathogens. Although commensals represent the predominant lifestyle of plant-associated microbes, it is crucial to acknowledge that commensalism, regardless of the life form, remains understudied [\(Mathis and](#page-17-0)  [Bronstein 2020\)](#page-17-0). Commensal bacteria beneft from interaction with host plants without eliciting overt harm [\(Drew et](#page-16-0) al. 2021). Unlike pathogens, which can evade host defenses and exploit the host for infection [\(Chen et](#page-16-1) al. 2021), or root symbionts, which receive nutrients from plants in exchange for services (Bell et [al. 2021\)](#page-16-2), commensal bacteria encounter challenges in navigating host immunity and competing for resources to ensure their survival (Yu et [al. 2019,](#page-17-1) [Teixeira et](#page-17-2) al. 2021).

<span id="page-0-10"></span><span id="page-0-9"></span><span id="page-0-8"></span><span id="page-0-5"></span><span id="page-0-4"></span><span id="page-0-3"></span>Plants perceive surrounding bacteria through microbialassociated molecular patterns (MAMPs) and induce an immune response known as pattern-triggered immunity (PTI) [\(Ngou et](#page-17-3) al. 2022). While most commensal bacterial strains in *Arabidopsis* harbor non-immunogenic fg22, a 22 amino-acid peptide derived from bacterial fagellin [\(Colaianni](#page-16-3)  et [al. 2021\)](#page-16-3), PTI can also be evoked by MAMPs of pathogenic bacteria. To evade this immune response, commensal bacteria have developed various strategies, such as altering root pH through gluconic acid secretion (Yu et [al. 2019\)](#page-17-1) and suppress-ing PTI via type II secretion system [\(Teixeira et](#page-17-2) al. 2021). While not all commensals can suppress plant immune responses, the

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License [\(https://creativecommons.org/licenses/](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) [by-nc/4.0/\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. For commercial re-use, please contact reprints@oup.com for reprints and translation rights for reprints. All other permissions can be obtained through our RightsLink service via the Permissions link on the article page on our site–for further information please contact journals.permissions@oup.com.

**Regular Pap**

<span id="page-0-7"></span><span id="page-0-6"></span>**e r**

*Plant Cell Physiol.* 00(00): 1–18 (2024) doi:https://doi.org/10.1093/pcp/pcae091, Advance Access publication on 24 August 2024, available online at https://academic.oup.com/pcp

<sup>©</sup> The Author(s) 2024. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of Japanese Society of Plant Physiologists.

intriguing suppression of plant immune responses by certain commensal strains provides opportunities for non-suppressor commensals to colonize plant roots [\(Teixeira et](#page-17-2) al. 2021).

<span id="page-1-8"></span>Upon evading plant immunity, commensal bacteria must compete with other microbes for plant-derived nutrients. Some commensals exhibit preferences for host plants [\(Wippel et](#page-17-4) al. [2021\)](#page-17-4), and others display habitat preferences along the root axis from where preferable nutrients are secreted [\(Wei et](#page-17-5) al. [2021,](#page-17-5) Loo et [al. 2024\)](#page-16-4). Root exudates offer a diverse yet limited nutrient pool, favoring bacteria with diverse metabolomic genes that aford fexibility in utilizing available sources [\(Matilla](#page-17-6)  et [al. 2007,](#page-17-6) [Nogales et](#page-17-7) al. 2008). Hence, exploring the dynamics of plant–commensal microbe interactions has emerged as an intriguing area of research for understanding the complexity of plant–microbe interactions.

<span id="page-1-11"></span><span id="page-1-10"></span><span id="page-1-7"></span><span id="page-1-5"></span>*Allorhizobium vitis* VAR03-1 is a biocontrol agent for crown gall disease in grapevines caused by a pathogenic *A. vitis* harboring tumor-inducing (Ti) plasmid [\(Kawaguchi et](#page-16-5) al. 2005, [2007,](#page-16-6) Kuzmanović et al. 2018, [Noutoshi et](#page-17-8) al. 2020b). Our previous research has identifed that the biocontrol activity of VAR03-1 mainly relies on the production of rhizoviticin (Ishii et [al. 2024\)](#page-16-8), a phage tail-like bacteriocin that is toxic to other *A. vitis* strains or related species. Interestingly, rhizoviticindefcient VAR03-1 mutants still showed disease-suppressive activity. This may be due to competition for host surface habitat with pathogens. Therefore, we are interested in the colonization mechanism of this commensal bacterium. The biocontrol activity of VAR03-1 against crown gall has been demonstrated on various host plants, but no adverse efects on these hosts have been reported, indicating a commensal lifestyle of VAR03-1 on them [\(Kawaguchi et](#page-16-5) al. 2005, [2007,](#page-16-6) [2008,](#page-16-9) [2012\)](#page-16-10).

Here, we investigated the growth pattern of VAR03-1 in the rhizosphere of *Arabidopsis thaliana* using the Murashige and Skoog (MS) agar system and compared it with that of another biocontrol agent, *Pseudomonas protegens* Cab57. Their growth area on and around *Arabidopsis* roots was clearly diferent and seemed to depend on their nutrient requirements for growth. Supplementation of sucrose in the medium resulted in bacterial overgrowth leading to host growth inhibition, highlighting the importance of strict quality and quantity control of nutrient supply from the roots to regulate the microbial community.

#### **Results**

# **Colonization patterns of A. vitis strains and P. protegens Cab57 in the Arabidopsis rhizosphere**

To characterize the root colonization behavior of VAR03-1 in the rhizosphere, we used *Arabidopsis* as a model inoculation system. VAR03-1 cells were mixed into MS agar without any sugars, and *Arabidopsis* seedlings were grown semi-vertically to observe bacterial growth in the rhizosphere. VAR03-1 (a fnal Optical Density at 600 nm (OD<sub>600</sub>) value of 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>) enhanced the primary root (PR) growth of *Arabidopsis* (**[Fig.](#page-2-0) 1A**). Please note that we consistently observed a trend of VAR03-1 enhancing *Arabidopsis* root growth throughout the study (refer to <span id="page-1-14"></span><span id="page-1-13"></span><span id="page-1-9"></span>diferent experimental trials in **[Fig.](#page-2-0) 1E**). However, statistical signifcance was not achieved in some experiments due to the instability of seedling growth on MS agar without sucrose after transplantation. The shoot weight was not significantly affected (**[Fig.](#page-2-0) 1B**). Around the PR, colonies of VAR03-1 were observed, with an uneven distribution along the root axis. A higher population density was found in the upper part of the PR compared to the lower part (**[Fig.](#page-2-0) 1C**). To determine whether this colonization pattern is specifc to VAR03-1, we used the other strains of *A. vitis*: VAR06-30 (a non-pathogenic and non-antagonistic strain) and VAT03-9 (Ti) (a pathogenic strain). These two A. *vitis* strains also showed similar growth patterns (**[Fig.](#page-2-0) 1D**) and promoted the lengthening of *Arabidopsis* PR without signifcantly afecting shoot growth (**Fig. [1E–G](#page-2-0)**), suggesting that this colonization behavior is a common feature of *A. vitis* in its interaction with *Arabidopsis* as a commensal organism. To further understand bacterial colonization activity, we used *P. protegens* Cab57, another biocontrol agent, as a control. Interestingly, no visible colonies of Cab57 were observed around the PR (**[Fig.](#page-2-0) 1D**). However, Cab57 reduced the length of the *Arabidopsis* PR, despite not signifcantly afecting the shoots (**Fig. [1E–G](#page-2-0)**). Tis suggests that Cab57 may colonize the surface or interior of the plant root tissues at levels not detectable by visible colonies, possibly exerting a negative efect on root growth.

## <span id="page-1-4"></span><span id="page-1-2"></span>**Diference in the nutrient requirements of the commensal bacteria tested**

<span id="page-1-12"></span><span id="page-1-6"></span><span id="page-1-3"></span><span id="page-1-1"></span><span id="page-1-0"></span>To understand the reason behind the diferences in colonization patterns observed in these bacterial genera, we examined their proliferation in liquid MS medium. Neither bacterial species showed an increase in the MS medium supplemented only with vitamins (Fig. [2A–E](#page-3-0)). This indicates that their growth in the *Arabidopsis* rhizosphere, as shown in **[Fig.](#page-2-0) 1**, relies on nutrients, primarily carbon sources, derived from the host roots. To test whether these bacteria have specifc requirements or preferences for carbon sources for their growth, we added various types of sugars commonly found in root exudates to the MS medium at diferent concentrations [\(Badri et](#page-16-11) al. 2009, [Chaparro](#page-16-12)  et [al. 2013\)](#page-16-12). Song et [al. \(2022\)](#page-17-9) reported that 5-day-old *Arabidopsis* Col-0 seedlings grown hydroponically secrete approximately 40 mg/l (0.12 mM) of sucrose in 24 h. In *Arabidopsis* research, 1% sucrose (29.2 mM) is one of the standard concentrations. Therefore, we tested a range of sugar concentrations from 0.1 to 25 mM. As a result, VAR03-1 was able to grow in MS medium supplemented with all tested sugars (glucose, fructose, sucrose and mannitol) at concentrations ≥1 mM (**Fig. [2A–D](#page-3-0)**). Among the sugars tested, sucrose provided the best growth of VAR03- 1 at a minimum concentration of 10 mM (**[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2C**). Next, we compared the growth of VAR03-1 and Cab57 in liquid MS medium supplemented with 1% sucrose. Under these conditions, VAR03-1 reached an  $OD<sub>600</sub>$  value of approximately 0.9 for 20 h, whereas Cab57 only reached an  $OD_{600}$  value of 0.2, with no further increase even with extended incubation (**[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2E**).

In addition to sugars, organic acids are reported to be present in root exudates, some of which are recognized



<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Fig. 1 Colonization of *A. vitis* strains in the *Arabidopsis* rhizosphere in MS agar medium. (A, B) PR length (A) and shoot fresh weight (B) of *Arabidopsis* plants 8 d after transplanting on MS agar medium inoculated with VAR03-1 (OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>). Statistical significance was analyzed using the Mann–Whitney *U* test (*n* = 28). Data from two individual experimental sets were used. (C) Colonies of VAR03-1 along the PR of *Arabidopsis* grown in MS agar medium, with magnifcation on specifc parts of the PR indicated by boxes 1, 2, 3 and 4. Black bar, 1 cm. White bars, 1 mm. (D) Colonies of *A. vitis* strains and *P. protegens* Cab57 around *Arabidopsis* upper PR and root tip regions. Bars, 1 mm. (E, F) PR length (E) and shoot weight (F) of *Arabidopsis* plants 8 d after transplanting on MS agar medium inoculated with *A. vitis* strains or Cab57 (OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup> each). Statistical signifcance was analyzed using the Brown–Forsythe ANOVA and Dunnett's T3 multiple comparison test (*n* = 16) (E) and ANOVA followed by Tukey's test (*n* = 16) (F). Letters indicate signifcant diferences. (G) Morphology of *Arabidopsis* seedlings 8 d after transplanting on MS medium inoculated with *A. vitis* strains and Cab57. Bar, 1 cm. All experiments were repeated at least twice with similar results.



<span id="page-3-0"></span>

Fig. 2 Growth of *A. vitis* and *P. protegens* Cab57 in liquid MS medium supplemented with sugars and/or organic acids. (A–D) Growth of *A. vitis* VAR03-1 in liquid MS medium supplemented with different sugars (glucose, fructose, sucrose and mannitol). OD<sub>600</sub> was measured at the indicated times during cultivation. (E) Growth of VAR03-1 and Cab57 in liquid MS medium with or without 1% sucrose. (F) Growth of VAR03-1 in liquid MS medium supplemented with five organic acids (shikimic acid, citrate, L-aspartic acid, p-hydroxybenzoate or L-proline 5-oxo) (200 μM each) and a mixture of the fve organic acids (50 μM each) with or without 10 mM sucrose. (G) Growth of *A. vitis* strains and Cab57 in liquid MS medium supplemented with a mixture of four organic acids (citrate, l-aspartic acid, *p*-hydroxybenzoate and l-proline 5-oxo) (C1, 50 μM or C2, 200 μM) or 200 μM sucrose with 10 mM sucrose. All experiments were repeated at least twice with similar results.

<span id="page-3-1"></span>by pathogenic bacteria for the full induction of virulence [\(Anderson et](#page-15-0) al. 2014). We evaluated the growth of VAR03- 1 in liquid MS medium supplemented with  $200 \mu$ M of five selected organic acids (shikimic acids, citrate, aspartic acid, *p*hydroxybenzoate and proline 5-oxo). These five organic acids have been identifed in *Arabidopsis* root exudates and are shown to infuence the induction of virulence genes in *Pseudomonas syringae* at an efective concentration of 200 μM [\(Anderson et](#page-15-0) al. 2014). However, VAR03-1 growth was not induced by supplementation with 200 μM of each organic acid alone (**[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2F**, dotted line). Additional bacterial growth was only observed when 10 mM sucrose was also supplemented along with the organic acids ([Fig.](#page-3-0) 2F). This result indicates that sucrose is a major limiting factor for the growth of VAR03- 1. The  $OD_{600}$  of VAR03-1 culture reached approximately 0.6 in sucrose-supplemented MS medium and increased to about 0.7–0.9 when citrate, l-aspartic acid, *p*-hydroxybenzoate or lproline 5-oxo was added (**[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2F**). In contrast, shikimic acid did not produce an additive efect on the growth of VAR03-1 (**[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2F**). Supplementation with all fve organic acids together



in the MS medium with sucrose did not enhance growth further than the single organic acid supplements. These results suggest that the presence of at least one of these four organic acids is sufficient to achieve the additive growth effect observed with sucrose.

Next, we investigated whether the nutrient requirement (a combination of sucrose and organic acids) observed in VAR03- 1 is a common feature among *A. vitis* strains. VAR03-1, VAT03-9 and VAR06-30 were cultured in MS medium containing 10 mM sucrose and/or 50 or 200 μM of a mixture of four organic acids (citrate, aspartic acid, *p*-hydroxybenzoate and proline 5-oxo), and their growth curves were compared. As shown in **[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2G**, all *A. vitis* strains demonstrated similar dependence on sucrose and organic acids for their growth. Interestingly, their degree of dependence on each type of organic acid varied slightly among these strains. While sucrose is the main limiting factor for the growth of VAR03-1, VAR06-30 requires both sucrose and organic acids for full growth. VAT03-9 exhibited an intermediate growth pattern between VAR03-1 and VAR06-30. Tis observation is consistent with the number of visible colonies around the PR shown in **[Fig.](#page-2-0) 1D**. In the same experimental setting, we also assessed the nutrient requirements of Cab57. When grown in MS medium supplemented with sucrose and organic acids, Cab57 reached an  $OD<sub>600</sub>$  value of around 0.6, indicating that Cab57 relies on these molecules for growth, with a particularly signifcant contribution from organic acids (**[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2G**).

# **Interaction of VAR03-1 and Arabidopsis with exogenously applied sucrose**

Our results demonstrated that sucrose is the primary carbon source essential for the growth of VAR03-1, suggesting that sucrose may play a signifcant role in the interaction of VAR03- 1 and plants. To explore the role of sucrose in this interaction, we supplemented MS agar with a concentration series of sucrose (ranging from 0.1 to 10 mM). In the presence of sucrose at concentrations of 1 mM or higher, the PR length of *Arabidopsis* was signifcantly reduced by VAR03-1 (**[Fig.](#page-5-0) 3A**). This sucrose-dependent inhibitory effect was also observed in the upper-ground parts of the plant at 1 mM, becoming more pronounced as the sucrose concentration increased to 10 mM (**[Fig.](#page-5-0) 3B**). In the rhizosphere, the number and density of VAR03-1 colonies surrounding the *Arabidopsis* PR increased in a concentration-dependent manner (**[Fig.](#page-5-0) 3C**). Although VAR03- 1 colonies were distributed across the plate, likely due to their ability to utilize sucrose for growth, the densest populations were still observed in the upper-middle regions of the PR under sucrose-supplemented condition, even at 10 mM (**[Fig.](#page-5-0) 3D**). To determine whether this sugar-dependent growth inhibition was specifc to sucrose, we tested the efect of other sugars (glucose, fructose, mannitol and arabinose) on *Arabidopsis* growth in the presence of VAR03-1 (**[Fig.](#page-5-0) 3E**). At a concentration of 10 mM, glucose, mannitol and arabinose, but not fructose, signifcantly inhibited PR length. Additionally, VAR03-1 colonies increased

in response to these sugars in a manner similar to that observed with sucrose (**[Supplementary Fig. S1](#page-15-1)**).

We hypothesized that the excessive proliferation of VAR03-1 might be responsible for the observed inhibition of *Arabidopsis* growth. To test this, we examined the *Arabidopsis* growth on MS agar supplemented with higher concentrations of VAR03- 1 (final OD<sub>600</sub> values of 5 × 10<sup>-3</sup> and 5 × 10<sup>-2</sup>, representing 10and 100-fold increases, respectively, over the concentration used in [Fig.](#page-2-0) 1). These higher concentrations of VAR03-1 reduced both PR length and shoot weight in *Arabidopsis*, even in the absence of exogenous sucrose (**Fig. [3F–H](#page-5-0)**). Although the inhibition was less pronounced than in the presence of sucrose, similar efects were observed (**[Fig.](#page-5-0) 3H**). Notably, the inoculation of heat-killed (HK) VAR03-1 did not inhibit *Arabidopsis* growth, indicating that the inhibitory efect is associated with the activities of live bacterial cells (**Fig. [3F, G](#page-5-0)**). In sucrosesupplemented MS agar medium with VAR03-1, the onset of PR length inhibition occurred 4 d after planting young *Arabidopsis* seedlings (**[Supplementary Fig. S2](#page-15-1)**). Tis result suggests that a certain threshold number of bacterial cells, which increased over 3 d, is necessary to exert a negative efect on *Arabidopsis* PR. Taken together, these results indicate that the proliferation of VAR03-1 cells above a certain level, driven by sugar supplementation, results in the inhibition of *Arabidopsis* seedling growth.

To further clarify this point, we searched for VAR03- 1 mutants generated via transposon (Tn)-mediated random mutagenesis that had lost their growth inhibitory activity on *Arabidopsis* in sucrose-supplemented MS agar medium. Two mutants,  $\Delta$ 65 and  $\Delta$ 86, were successfully isolated, both exhibiting reduced inhibitory efects (**[Supplementary Fig. S3A, B](#page-15-1)**). The  $\Delta$ 86 mutant completely lost its inhibitory effect on both root and shoot growth, while the  $\Delta$ 65 mutant showed a partial reduction; the inhibitory efect on shoot growth was largely diminished, but the efect on root remained similar to that of the wild-type (WT) strain. Both mutants demonstrated slightly slower growth in King's B (KB) medium compared to the WT strain (**[Supplementary Fig. S3C](#page-15-1)**). In MS medium containing sucrose, the  $\Delta$ 86 mutant exhibited minimal growth, reaching only 24.2% of the WT strain's growth over a 16-h culture period. Meanwhile, the  $\Delta$ 65 strain reached 63.5% of the WT strains' growth within the same period (**[Supplementary Fig.](#page-15-1) [S3D](#page-15-1)**).

Based on these growth characteristics, the  $\Delta$ 65 mutant displayed a colonization pattern similar to the WT strain, with visible colonies around the PR that increased in density with sucrose supplementation (**[Supplementary Fig. S3E](#page-15-1)**). In contrast, the  $\Delta$ 86 mutant did not form visible colonies around the PR and appeared to adhere to the root surface (**[Supplemen](#page-15-1)[tary Fig. S3E](#page-15-1)**). The density of the  $\Delta$ 86 mutant colonies on the root surface progressively increased in the presence of 10 mM sucrose ([Supplementary Fig. S3E](#page-15-1)). The higher magnification observations revealed that the  $\Delta$ 86 mutant produced a small number of colonies at a short distance from the PR, and this pattern remained similar under 0.1 and 1 mM sucrose conditions.

<span id="page-5-0"></span>



Fig. 3 Efects of sucrose on the *Arabidopsis* growth with *A. vitis* VAR03-1 in MS agar medium. (A, B) PR length (A) and morphology (B) of *Arabidopsis* plants grown on MS agar medium with VAR03-1 (OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>) supplemented with different concentrations of sucrose (0.1, 1 and 10 mM). Data from two distinct experimental sets were used. Statistical signifcance was analyzed using Mann–Whitney *U* test (*n* = 24). ns, not signifcant; \*\**P* < 0.001. Bar, 1 cm. (C) Colonies of VAR03-1 around the upper PR regions of *Arabidopsis* roots in MS agar medium supplemented with diferent concentrations of sucrose (0.1, 1 and 10 mM). (D) Colonies of VAR03-1 along the PR of *Arabidopsis* grown in MS agar medium supplemented with 10 mM sucrose. Magnifcation images from some specifc area along the roots indicated by boxes 1, 2, 3 and 4 were provided accordingly. Enlarged images of the specifc area indicated by boxes 1, 2, 3 and 4 are provided. Black bar, 1 cm. White bars, 1 mm. (E) Length of *Arabidopsis* PR 8 d after transplanting on MS agar medium supplemented with diferent sugars (glucose, fructose, mannitol and arabinose, 10 mM each). Statistical signifcance was analyzed using Welch's *t*-test (*n* = 8) for comparison between mock and bacterial treatment in each sucrose assay. \**P* < 0.05. (F, G) PR length (F) and shoot fresh weight (G) of *Arabidopsis* plants 14 d after transplanting on MS agar medium inoculated with VAR03-1 at diferent concentrations as indicated. Statistical signifcance was analyzed using the Kruskal–Wallis test followed by Dunn's test (*n* = 21) (F) and the Brown– Forsythe ANOVA followed by Dunnett's T3 test (*n* = 21) (G). \*\**P* < 0.001; \**P* < 0.05; ns, not signifcant. (H) Morphology of *Arabidopsis* seedlings 14 d after transplanting on MS medium inoculated with VAR03-1 at the indicated concentrations. Bar, 1 cm. All experiments were repeated at least twice with similar results.



A relatively thicker bacterial layer was observed only at 10 mM sucrose.

<span id="page-6-3"></span><span id="page-6-1"></span>We identifed the Tn insertion sites using the plasmid-rescue method, revealing that the  $\Delta$ 65 and  $\Delta$ 86 mutants contained Tns within the *cobJ* and *mprF* genes, respectively (**[Supplemen](#page-15-1)**[tary Fig. S3G, H](#page-15-1)). The *cobJ* gene encodes precorrin-3B methyltransferase, which is involved in the biosynthesis of cobalamin, a cofactor of several enzymatic reactions, including cobalamindependent ribonucleotide reductase for deoxynucleotide syn-thesis [\(Cowles et](#page-16-13) al. 1969). The *mprF* gene encodes the multiple peptide resistance factor, a bifunctional protein that synthesizes aminoacyl phospholipids or ions and translocates them to the outer leafets of bacterial membranes (Song et [al. 2021,](#page-17-10) Lee et [al. 2022\)](#page-16-14). This function is essential for bacterial survival against cationic antimicrobial peptides [\(Ernst and Peschel](#page-16-15)  [2011\)](#page-16-15) and adaptation to acidic environment (Sohlenkamp et [al. 2007\)](#page-17-11). Our results are consistent with previous studies that screened for less-colonizing bacterial mutants, identifying causal genes related to metabolism (Cole et [al. 2017,](#page-16-16) [Sivaku](#page-17-12)mar et [al. 2019\)](#page-17-12). Currently, it remains unclear whether the function of each causal protein directly infuences the sucrosedependent growth inhibition of *Arabidopsis* plants. However, the defective proliferation phenotypes of both mutants in sucrose-containing MS medium were at least consistent with their diminished impact on *Arabidopsis* growth inhibition, where mutants with slower growth colonized poorly and hence induced less inhibition. Therefore, these results support the hypothesis that bacterial overgrowth is a cause of the inhibitory efect on *Arabidopsis* growth.

# **Bacterial-induced inhibition of Arabidopsis growth in the presence of exogenous sucrose exhibits non-strain-specifc behavior**

To determine whether the growth inhibition observed in the presence of sucrose was specifc to VAR03-1, we evaluated two other *A. vitis* strains and *P. protegens* Cab57. Under sucrose-free conditions, all *A. vitis* strains, including the pathogenic VAT03- 9, slightly promoted PR growth, indicating a consistent efect regardless of pathogenicity (**Fig. [1E, G](#page-2-0)**). However, with sucrose supplementation, signifcant growth inhibition was observed in both root and shoot parts across all *A. vitis*–treated seedlings compared to the control (**Fig. [4A–C](#page-7-0)**). Notably, the severity of the growth inhibition varied among the strains: VAT03-9 caused more pronounced PR and shoot inhibition than VAR03- 1, while VAR06-30 induced a similar level of PR inhibition but signifcantly less shoot inhibition compared to VAR03-1. Meanwhile, Cab57 signifcantly reduced PR length even in the absence of sucrose (**Fig. [1E, G](#page-2-0)**). Upon sucrose supplementation, Cab57 induced growth inhibition on PR length in a concentration-dependent manner (**[Supplementary Fig. S4A](#page-15-1)**). Shoot size remained similar across all sucrose concentrations tested, although it increased with sucrose supplementation. At 10 mM sucrose, Cab57 induced more severe PR inhibition than any of the *A. vitis* strains and also showed an inhibitory efect on shoot growth similar to that of the *A. vitis* strains (**Fig. [4A–C](#page-7-0)**). Visible colonies of Cab57 were not observed in MS agar medium at any site along the PR under no-sucrose conditions, but a small number of colonies were detected with sucrose, increasing with higher sucrose concentrations (**[Sup](#page-15-1)[plementary Fig. S4C](#page-15-1)**). At 1 and 10 mM sucrose, *Arabidopsis* root morphology was severely afected with reduced PR length and increased number of lateral roots. Interestingly, swelling of the PR tip was observed in the presence of Cab57 specifcally under 1 mM sucrose conditions (**[Supplementary Fig. S4C–](#page-15-1) [E](#page-15-1)**), which may be due to the accumulation of mucilage. These results suggest that bacterial-induced growth inhibition in the presence of sucrose is not unique to VAR03-1, as evidenced by the inhibitory efects observed in all *A. vitis* strains and *P. protegens* Cab57.

# <span id="page-6-6"></span><span id="page-6-5"></span><span id="page-6-2"></span>**Relationship between nutrient requirements and bacterial growth patterns in the Arabidopsis rhizosphere**

<span id="page-6-4"></span><span id="page-6-0"></span>To further confrm the relationship between nutrient requirements and bacterial colonization patterns in the *Arabidopsis* rhizosphere, we transplanted *Arabidopsis* seedlings onto MS agar containing 10 mM sucrose together with a mixture of four organic acids (citrate, aspartic acid, *p*-hydroxybenzoate and 5 oxo-proline). These acids, at varying concentrations (50, 100 or  $200 \mu$ M each), had previously enhanced the growth of VAR03-1 in vitro (**[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2F**). In this setup, seedling growth inhibition was exacerbated by the supplementation of organic acids in a concentration-dependent manner (**[Fig.](#page-8-0) 5**; **[Supplementary Fig.](#page-15-1)  [S5](#page-15-1)**). In the presence of VAR03-1, seedling growth inhibition was further intensifed by organic acid supplementation compared to sucrose alone (**[Fig.](#page-8-0) 5A**, top row). Although colony formation of VAR03-1 around *Arabidopsis* roots was observed with both sucrose and organic acids, no visible increase in bacterial colony density from organic acid supplementation was apparent at any position along the PR (**[Fig.](#page-8-0) 5A**; upper part, second row; lower part, third row; tip, fourth row). Quantifying bacterial cells in the agar medium might indicate increased bacterial titers, but it is technically challenging at this time. For Cab57, organic acids also exacerbated seedling growth inhibition, although statistical diferences in PR length and shoot weight compared to sucrose alone were not detected (**[Fig.](#page-8-0) 5B**, top row; **[Sup](#page-15-1)[plementary Fig. S5](#page-15-1)**). In contrast to VAR03-1, closer magnifcation revealed that Cab57 colonies surrounding the PR, and even in the agar medium away from the roots, appeared to become denser and larger with higher concentrations of organic acids ([Fig.](#page-8-0) 5B, middle and bottom rows). The colony formation patterns of VAR03-1 and Cab57 on agar medium supplemented with sucrose and organic acids were consistent with their nutrient requirements for growth in liquid MS culture (**[Fig.](#page-3-0) 2G**). For both bacterial species, colony density appeared to be higher around plant roots compared to distant areas, suggesting the necessity of additional plant-derived nutrients beyond sucrose and the tested organic acids for full growth in the rhizosphere.



<span id="page-7-0"></span>

Fig. 4 Efect of sucrose on *Arabidopsis* growth in MS agar medium inoculated with *A. vitis* strains and *P. protegens* Cab57. (A–C) PR length (A), shoot fresh weight (B) and morphology (C) of *Arabidopsis* plants 8 d after transplanting onto 10 mM sucrose-containing MS agar medium inoculated with *A. vitis* strains or Cab57 (OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>). Statistical significance was analyzed using the Brown–Forsythe ANOVA followed by Dunnett's T3 multiple comparison test (*n* = 16) (A) and ANOVA followed by Tukey's test (*n* = 16) (B). Letters indicate signifcant diferences. Bar, 1 cm. All experiments were repeated at least twice with similar results.

## **VAR03-1-induced Arabidopsis growth inhibition in the mutants for PTI**

<span id="page-7-4"></span><span id="page-7-1"></span>Plant growth inhibition triggered by immune responses to surrounding microbes often results from a trade-off between growth and defense [\(Boller and Felix 2009\)](#page-16-17). Such inhibition could be abolished in plant mutants with compromised immune responses corresponding to the underlying causal factors [\(Okada et](#page-17-13) al. 2021). To investigate the cause of the VAR03- 1-induced growth suppression in the presence of sucrose, we examined whether the inhibition induced by overgrowth of VAR03-1 was associated with PTI by employing *Arabidopsis* mutants *efr1, bak1-5/bkk1-1* and *bik1*, which are defective in the perception of elf18, a potential MAMP for *A. vitis* [\(Kunze et](#page-16-18) al. [2004\)](#page-16-18) and MAMP-triggered signaling (Lu et [al. 2010,](#page-16-19) [Roux et](#page-17-14) al. [2011\)](#page-17-14), respectively. As shown in **Fig. [6A, B](#page-9-0)**, both mutants exhibited growth inhibition in response to VAR03-1 in the presence of sucrose, similar to the WT.

<span id="page-7-3"></span>Next, to confrm these results, we evaluated the growth inhibition of these *Arabidopsis* mutants in response to supplementation with a high concentration of VAR03-1 under sucrose-free conditions. Similar to the WT, all the tested *Arabidopsis* mutants showed reductions in PR length and shoot weight in response to VAR03-1 supplementation, at least at  $OD_{600} = 5 \times 10^{-2}$ , and in some cases at 5 × 10<sup>-3</sup> (**Fig. [6C, D](#page-9-0)**). This suggests that VAR03-1induced growth inhibition, regardless of the addition of exogenous sucrose, was not dependent on PTI, at least mediated by gene products tested.

To further investigate the involvement of PTI in the interaction between VAR03-1 and *Arabidopsis*, we compared the root and shoot weight of *Arabidopsis* seedlings (WT, *efr1* and *bak1-5/bkk1-1*) grown with VAR03-1 at  $OD_{600} = 5 \times 10^{-4}$  and  $5 \times 10^{-3}$ . This comparison revealed that the growth inhibition triggered by VAR03-1 at an OD<sub>600</sub> value of  $5 \times 10^{-3}$  was more pronounced in these *Arabidopsis* mutants, particularly in *bak1-5/bkk1-1*, compared to the WT (**Fig. [6E, F](#page-9-0)**). To estimate the reason for this diference, we cultivated these *Arabidopsis* seedlings in a hydroponic culture supplemented with VAR03-1 at  $OD_{600} = 5 \times 10^{-4}$  and  $5 \times 10^{-3}$  and then counted the number of cells both on the root surface and in the liquid medium. Higher numbers of colonies were detected on the roots of *bak1-5/bkk1-1* compared to the WT at both inoculation concentrations (**[Fig.](#page-9-0) 6G**). Additionally, increased colony numbers were observed in all plant genotypes at  $OD_{600} = 5 \times 10^{-3}$  compared to those at  $OD_{600} = 5 \times 10^{-4}$ . It is noteworthy that this increased population of VAR03-1 in the mutant was observed only on the root surface, not in the medium ([Fig.](#page-9-0) 6H). This result implies that plant immunity, particularly mediated by BAK1-BKK1, plays a specifc role in regulating the VAR03-1 population in *Arabidopsis* roots. In terms of morphological alterations, the *bak1-5/bkk1-1* mutant facilitated higher levels of VAR03-1 colonization on the roots compared to the WT, and this increased population of VAR03-1 resulted in more severe growth inhibition in the mutant.

# <span id="page-7-5"></span><span id="page-7-2"></span>**Arabidopsis growth inhibition induced by VAR03-1 in the defense hormone mutants**

To further analyze the involvement of plant immunity in the plant–microbe interaction, we used *Arabidopsis* mutants impaired in salicylic acid biosynthesis and signaling (*npr1-5, sid2-2* and *eds1-2*) and ethylene signaling (*etr1-1*). None of the tested mutants showed a reduction in the inhibitory efects on both PR length and shoot weight compared to the WT in



<span id="page-8-0"></span>



Fig. 5 Growth and bacterial colonization of VAR03-1 (A) and Cab57 (B) colonies around *Arabidopsis* seedlings 5 d after transplantation into MS agar supplemented with 10 mM sucrose with or without a combination of four organic acids (citrate, aspartic acid, *p*-hydroxybenzoate and proline 5-oxo) at diferent concentrations (50, 100 or 200 μM each). Seedling morphology and bacterial colonies on MS agar plate (frst row) and the enlarged image at upper (second row) and tip (third row) parts of PR. The fourth row in (A) provides a further magnified view of the PR tip of the boxes in the third row. Black bars, 1 cm. White bars, 1 mm. All experiments were repeated at least twice with similar results.

the presence of VAR03-1 under sucrose supplement conditions (**Fig. [7A, B](#page-10-0)**).

For further confrmation, we assessed the expression level of *FRK1* and *PDF1.2*, marker genes for PTI, in both root and shoot tissues of *Arabidopsis* seedlings 8 d after transferring to MS agar containing VAR03-1 supplemented with diferent concentrations of sucrose. The expressions of these genes were generally higher in the presence of VAR03-1 compared to the uninoculated condition, except for *FRK1* expression in roots (**Fig. [7C,](#page-10-0)  [D](#page-10-0)**), indicating the immune response of *Arabidopsis* seedlings



<span id="page-9-0"></span>

Fig. 6 Efect of sucrose in the presence of VAR03-1 or high concentrations of VAR03-1 cells on the growth of *Arabidopsis* PTI mutants. (A, B) PR length (A) and shoot fresh weight (B) of *Arabidopsis* mutants (Col-0 (WT), *efr1, bak1-5/bkk1-1* and *bik1*) 8 d after transplanting on MS agar medium with VAR03-1 (OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>) supplemented with 10 mM sucrose. Statistical significance was analyzed using Student's *t*-test (*n* = 32) (A) and the Mann–Whitney *U* test (*n* = 16) (B). \*\**P* < 0.001. (C, D) PR length (C) and shoot fresh weight (D) of *Arabidopsis* mutants (Col-0 (WT), *efr1, bak1-5/bkk1-1* and *bik1*) 14 d after transplanting on MS agar medium with different concentrations of VAR03-1 (OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>, 5 × 10<sup>-3</sup> and 5 × 10−2). Statistical signifcance was analyzed using the Kruskal–Wallis test followed by Dunn's comparison test (*n* = 21) (C) and the Brown– Forsythe ANOVA followed by Dunnett's T3 (*n* = 21) (D). ns, not signifcant; \**P* < 0.05; \*\**P* < 0.001. (E, F) Fresh weights of roots (E) and shoots (F) of *Arabidopsis* seedlings (Col-0 (WT), *efr1* and *bak1-5/bkk1-1*) 10 d after transplanting into a sucrose-free hydroponic culture inoculated with high concentrations of VAR03-1 (OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup> and 5 × 10<sup>-3</sup>). Statistical significance was analyzed using one-way ANOVA and Tukey's test (*n* = 8). ns, not signifcant; \**P* < 0.05; \*\**P* < 0.001. (G, H) Colony forming units (CFU) on roots (G) and medium (H) of *Arabidopsis* seedlings (Col-0 (WT), *efr1* and *bak1-5/bkk1-1*) 10 d after transplanting in hydroponic culture inoculated with high concentrations of VAR03-1 (OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup> and 5 × 10−3). Statistical signifcance in diferent genotypes for the same VAR03-1 concentrations and in diferent concentration samples for the same genotypes using two-way ANOVA and Tukey's test (*n* = 3). Letters indicate signifcant diferences among genotypes in each bacterial concentration. All experiments were repeated at least twice with similar results.



<span id="page-10-0"></span>

Fig. 7 Efect of VAR03-1 on the growth of *Arabidopsis* mutants related to defense hormones and fatty acid metabolism in the presence of sucrose. (A, B) PR length (A) and shoot fresh weight (B) of *Arabidopsis* plants (Col-0 (WT), *npr1-5, sid2-2, eds1-2, etr1-1* and *faah*) 8 d after transplanting on VAR03-1-inoculated MS agar medium containing 10 mM sucrose. Statistical signifcance of each mock treatment was analyzed using Student's *t*-test (*n* = 16). \*\**P* < 0.001. (C, D) Expression of *FRK1* (C) and *PDF1.2* (D) in shoot and root parts of *Arabidopsis* seedlings 8 d after transplanting on VAR03-1-inoculated MS agar supplemented with diferent concentrations of sucrose. (E) Expression of *FRK1* in roots of *Arabidopsis* seedlings 3 d after application of 0.5 μM fg22 in MS agar supplemented with diferent concentrations of sucrose. Statistical signifcance was analyzed using ANOVA followed by Tukey's test (*n* = 3). All experiments were repeated at least twice with similar results.

to VAR03-1. In root tissues, *FRK1* gene expression was signifcantly downregulated in the presence of 1 and 10 mM sucrose (**[Fig.](#page-9-0) 6C**). In shoot parts, a substantial induction of the *FRK1* gene was detected in response to VAR03-1 without sucrose, which decreased in the presence of 1 and 10 mM sucrose. As for the *PDF1.2* gene, its expression was induced by VAR03- 1 in both roots and shoots, and it was decreased by sucrose in a concentration-dependent manner. Unlike the *FRK1* gene, a reduction of *PDF1.2* gene expression was observed even at 0.1 mM sucrose (**[Fig.](#page-10-0) 7D**). To evaluate the efect of sucrose itself on *Arabidopsis* responsiveness to PTI, we measured the expression of *FRK1* induced by fg22 in the root tissues of *Arabidopsis* seedlings grown on sucrose-containing media. As a result, no signifcant reduction in the induction levels of *FRK1* in response to fg22 was observed at sucrose concentrations ranging from 0.1 to 10 mM compared to the sucrose-free medium (**[Fig.](#page-10-0) 7E**). Plant growth suppression was observed even in the situation where defense gene expressions were attenuated in response to the overproliferation of VAR03-1 under conditions with sucrose (**Figs. [3A, B](#page-5-0)**, **[7C, D](#page-10-0)**), suggesting that the plant immune

response may not be the primary cause of this inhibitory effect.

# **N-acyl-l-homoserine lactone seems not to be involved in the VAR03-1-induced Arabidopsis growth inhibition**

<span id="page-11-12"></span><span id="page-11-6"></span>Bacteria produce *N*-acyl-l-homoserine lactones (AHLs) as signaling molecules to sense population density, which is crucial for controlling growth and facilitating the transition from a free-living state to biofilm formation [\(Verstraeten et](#page-17-15) al. 2008). The exogenous application of long-chain AHLs has been reported to inhibit *Arabidopsis* growth [\(Ortíz-Castro et](#page-17-16) al. 2008, [Palmer](#page-17-17)  et [al. 2014\)](#page-17-17). This inhibition is abolished in the knockout mutant and enhanced in the overexpressor of the *AtFAAH* (fatty acid amide hydrolase) gene, suggesting that ethylene production stimulated by homoserine from the metabolic conversion of AHLs by FAAH in *Arabidopsis* might be responsible for this efect [\(Palmer et](#page-17-17) al. 2014). To test whether AHLs contribute to VAR03-1-induced *Arabidopsis* growth inhibition in the presence of sucrose, we compared the response of *AtFAAH* mutants to the WT. Under our experimental conditions, two independent *AtFAAH* mutants showed reduced root length on MS medium containing both VAR03-1 and sucrose at a similar level to the WT (**Fig. [7A, B](#page-10-0)**). *A. vitis* strains, either virulent or non-virulent strains, have been reported to produce some long-chain AHLs, mediated by the *avsI* gene on their chromosome, which are basically impermeable through bacterial membranes [\(Li et](#page-16-20) al. [2006,](#page-16-20) [Wang et al. 2008,](#page-17-18) [Savka et](#page-17-19) al. 2011). We confrmed the presence of the *avsI* gene sequence in the VAR03-1 genome [\(Noutoshi et](#page-17-8) al. 2020b). Hence, we assume that VAR03-1 also produces long-chain AHLs. Similar research on *P. aeruginosa* has shown that long-chain AHLs are impermeable through bacterial membranes [\(Pearson et](#page-17-20) al. 1999). If this is also the case for VAR03-1, then the total external AHLs may not reach concentrations sufficient to induce plant-growth suppression, even though the ability of exogenously applied long-chain AHLs to inhibit plant growth. Taken together, we conclude that the AHLs produced by VAR03-1 may not signifcantly contribute to this growth inhibition.

# <span id="page-11-13"></span><span id="page-11-8"></span>**Involvement of RecA in VAR03-1-induced inhibition of Arabidopsis growth in the presence of sucrose**

<span id="page-11-14"></span><span id="page-11-9"></span><span id="page-11-5"></span><span id="page-11-3"></span><span id="page-11-2"></span><span id="page-11-1"></span>Commensal bacteria form bioflms on the root surface during colonization, and extracellular DNAs or polysaccharides play a critical role as the structural basis for bioflm formation [\(Verstraeten et](#page-17-15) al. 2008, [Ravaioli et](#page-17-21) al. 2020). Bioflm formation is regulated by RecA, a positive regulator of the Save Our Soul pathway, which responds to environmental stress [\(Turn](#page-17-22)bull et [al. 2016,](#page-17-22) [Kaushik et](#page-16-21) al. 2022, Wu et [al. 2022\)](#page-17-23). The loss of *recA* has been reported to reduce virulence in pathogenic bacteria [\(Martínez et](#page-16-22) al. 1997, [Fuchs et](#page-16-23) al. 1999, [Aranda et](#page-15-2) al. [2011,](#page-15-2) [Corral et](#page-16-24) al. 2020). Therefore, we investigated whether <span id="page-11-7"></span>bioflm formation is related to VAR03-1-induced growth inhibition of *Arabidopsis* in the presence of sucrose. To test this, we evaluated the effect of the *ArecA* mutant of VAR03-1 on the growth of *Arabidopsis* seedlings in MS agar containing sucrose. The growth inhibition induced by the  $\triangle$ recA mutant in both shoot and root parts was signifcantly reduced compared to the WT strain (Fig. [8A–C](#page-12-0)). The growth rate of  $\triangle$ recA was slightly lower than that of the WT strain in the liquid MS medium supplemented with sucrose, but its reduction level was smaller than those of Δ65 and Δ86 (**[Supplementary Fig. S3D](#page-15-1)**). Although not quantitatively evaluated, the colony density of  $\Delta$ recA in the surrounding area of the PR appeared to be decreased compared to the WT strain, and instead, the cell layer on the root surface appeared to be increased (**[Fig.](#page-12-0) 8D**). To further explore this result, we examined the biofilm formation of the  $\Delta$ recA mutant and found it to be higher than that of the WT strain (**[Fig.](#page-12-0) 8E**). Correspondingly, the number of free-living (planktonic) cells was reduced in the  $\triangle$ recA mutant compared to the WT strain in this in vitro experimental system ([Fig.](#page-12-0) 8F). These results suggest that RecA plays a negative role in the bioflm formation of VAR03-1. Given that the excessive sucrose-dependent growth inhibition of *Arabidopsis* seedlings was attenuated by the mutation in RecA, the deleterious activity of the increased VAR03-1 population may be associated more with bacterial behaviors typical of a free-living lifestyle rather than a sessile lifestyle.

# **Discussion**

<span id="page-11-10"></span><span id="page-11-4"></span>In this study, we explore the dynamics of the interaction between VAR03-1 and *Arabidopsis* under gnotobiotic conditions. VAR03-1 is a biocontrol agent for crown gall disease in grapevines. Disease suppression by antagonistic bacteria typically relies on its antibiotic activity against pathogens, as well as the induction of disease resistance in host plants. Additionally, competition for habitat on plant tissues plays an important role in this mechanism. Therefore, understanding the principles of rhizosphere colonization by biocontrol agents is necessary for expanding the use of biocontrol methods in crop protection, promoting environmentally friendly and sustainable agriculture.

<span id="page-11-11"></span><span id="page-11-0"></span>We used *Arabidopsis* as a model to investigate the interaction of VAR03-1 with plants, despite initial uncertainties about whether VAR03-1 could establish interaction with Brassicaceae, including *Arabidopsis*. Since *A. vitis* strains are frequently isolated from grapevines as the causal agents of crown gall disease, they may have a colonization advantage over other bacteria, including those within the same genus of *Rhizobium*, in grapevines. However, VAR03-1 has also been shown to protect other plants such as apples, pears, roses and sunfowers from crown gall [\(Kawaguchi et](#page-16-6) al. 2007, [2008,](#page-16-9) [2012\)](#page-16-10), suggesting its potential to colonize a range of plant species beyond Vitaceae. In our experiments, VAR03-1 was able to signifcantly increase its population in the vicinity of the *Arabidopsis* root system. It also promoted an increase in *Arabidopsis* PR length. These



<span id="page-12-0"></span>

Fig. 8 Effect of the *ArecA* mutant of VAR03-1 on the growth of *Arabidopsis* in the presence of sucrose. (A, B) PR length (A), shoot fresh weight (B) and morphology (C) of *Arabidopsis* plants 8 d after transplanting on 10 mM sucrose-containing MS agar medium inoculated with VAR03-1 (WT and *∆recA*, OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>). Statistical significance was analyzed using the Kruskal–Wallis test followed by Dunn's test (A) and ANOVA followed by Tukey's test (B) (*n* = 16). \**P* < 0.05; \*\**P* < 0.001; ns, not significant. Bar, 1 cm. (D) Colonies of VAR03-1 (WT and  $\triangle$ *recA*, OD<sub>600</sub> = 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>) around the upper PR regions of *Arabidopsis* roots 8 d after transplanting to MS agar containing 10 mM sucrose. (E, F) Bioflm formation (E) and planktonic cells (F) of VAR03-1 WT and *ArecA* mutant after 6 d of incubation in ATM medium. All experiments were repeated at least twice with similar results.

<span id="page-12-1"></span>fndings suggest that VAR03-1 can efectively interact with *Arabidopsis*, at least to some extent, resembling a commensal bacterium [\(Garrido-Oter et al. 2018\)](#page-16-25). Using a small model plant like *Arabidopsis* allows us to study the root colonization patterns of VAR03-1 and its efects on plant–microbe interactions.

However, the applicability of these fndings to other crops needs to be carefully validated.

We compared the colonization behavior of two diferent biocontrol bacterial agents, VAR03-1 and Cab57, from diferent genera, in the *Arabidopsis* rhizosphere. To our surprise,

<span id="page-13-6"></span>their growth patterns in the root area appear to be distinctly different. This variation seems to be attributable to their differing nutrient requirements. Recently, Loo et [al. \(2024\)](#page-16-4) reported that the composition of metabolic molecules of *Arabidopsis* roots varies depending on the position along the roots. Particularly, the distribution of Sugar Will Eventually be Exported Transporters, which control sugar sequestration, and sugars, including sucrose, are more abundant in the roots near the shoots compared to the tips. The sugars released from the roots may difuse into the agar in our experimental setup, creating a concentration gradient. Given that sucrose or other sugars are major limiting factors for the growth of VAR03-1, VAR03- 1 was able to form visible colonies in the *Arabidopsis* rhizosphere where sugar concentrations meet the growth demands of VAR03-1. Our results are consistent with previous fndings that, in the rhizosphere, the presence of sugars in root exudates can profoundly infuence microbial community dynamics, with particularly sucrose playing a signifcant role in shaping the microbial community during the early vegetative stage of maize [\(Lopes et](#page-16-26) al. 2022). The supplementation of sugars into the medium enables the further proliferation of VAR03-1 in this culture system. The background level of the number and density of VAR03-1 colonies elevated even at positions distant from *Arabidopsis* roots; however, the population gradient (predominant colonization near the upper part of the roots) was still observed. This suggests the presence of other limiting factors, including root exudates, for the full growth of VAR03-1 beyond sugars. This hypothesis is also supported by the varying effects of the *A. vitis* strains on PR length and shoot weight under 10 mM sucrose, which cannot solely be explained by their growth rates in the sucrose-containing liquid MS medium. The dependence of growth on organic acids may partly explain this observed difference. Since the composition of metabolites in root exudates varies among plant species [\(McLaughlin et](#page-17-24) al. 2023), diferences in the requirement for these molecules as nutrients may contribute to host specifcity and competition within the microbial community in the rhizosphere. Additionally, the catabolism or detoxifcation of host-specifc specialized metabolites may also play a role in selectivity [\(Shimasaki et](#page-17-25) al. 2021). This concept is exemplifed by the colonization pattern of Cab57. It colonized only the root surface and did not proliferate in the surrounding area of the PR. This behavior could be because Cab57 requires organic acids in addition to sugars for growth. With the supplementation of sugars, it began to form visible colonies near the roots and exhibited signifcant growth at the root tips when 1 mM sucrose was added. This habitat preference aligns with the observation that organic acids are predominantly released from root tips rather than other parts of the root (Loo et [al. 2024\)](#page-16-4). Consistently, the supplementation of organic acids with sucrose allowed Cab57 to grow in the agar. In the MS agar medium, Cab57 could not form visible colonies in the vicinity of the PR, suggesting that *Arabidopsis* may limit the total amount of nutrients released from roots to a level insufficient for the growth of Cab57, even at the root tip area. This restriction could be attributed to the deleterious efect of Cab57 on plant growth, <span id="page-13-12"></span>as observed in *Arabidopsis*. This notion is supported by studies indicating that transcriptional changes in several SWEET in root tissues are closely associated with pathogen infections [\(Zhou](#page-17-26)  et [al. 2023,](#page-17-26) Loo et [al. 2024\)](#page-16-4). Furthermore, plants have been shown to limit or alter root exudate compositions in response to microbial infections (Gu et [al. 2016\)](#page-16-27).

<span id="page-13-3"></span>Our study suggests a relationship between the habitat preference of commensal bacteria and their nutrient requirements in the rhizosphere. However, further analysis is needed to confrm whether such a relationship exists in soil. A previous study demonstrated a skewed distribution pattern of bacterial communities associated with particular genera in the apical, middle and rear parts of root sections in the soil rhizosphere where *Brachypodium distachyon* was grown (Wei et [al. 2021\)](#page-17-5).

For the biocontrol of plant diseases, it has been empirically established that potential antagonistic microorganisms belonging to the same genus as the pathogens can be efective. For example, VAR03-1 has been shown to efectively suppress crown gall caused by the pathogenic *A. vitis* [\(Kawaguchi et](#page-16-5)  [al. 2005,](#page-16-5) [2007\)](#page-16-6). Our study provides evidence supporting this experiential knowledge. Because the habitat preference of soil bacteria varies signifcantly based on their metabolic characteristics, as demonstrated in this study, it is prudent to select candidate biocontrol agents for specifc diseases from microbes that exhibit antagonistic activity and belong to the same genus as the target pathogen. Some strains of *Pseudomonas fuorescens* have been identifed as efective biocontrol agents for several crop diseases [\(Couillerot et](#page-16-28) al. 2009). *Pseudomonas protegens* strains, including CHA0, Pf-5, Cab57 and others, protect various crops against fungal pathogens and oomycetes (Défago et [al. 1990,](#page-16-29) [Pfender et](#page-17-27) al. 1993, [Takeuchi et](#page-17-28) al. 2014). The ability of *P. fuorescens* to colonize is crucial for providing protection to *Arabidopsis*, even against pathogens from the same genus *Pseudomonas* [\(Wang et](#page-17-29) al. 2022). Particularly for soil-borne pathogens, these bacteria may offer crop protection, predominantly in an epiphytic or endophytic manner near the root tip.

<span id="page-13-11"></span><span id="page-13-10"></span><span id="page-13-9"></span><span id="page-13-8"></span><span id="page-13-7"></span><span id="page-13-4"></span><span id="page-13-2"></span><span id="page-13-1"></span><span id="page-13-0"></span>A study by Burr et [al. \(1995\)](#page-16-30) found that *A. vitis* survived in decaying grapevine roots and canes buried in soil for 23 months. The decomposed plant materials, primarily consisting of cellulose and hemicellulose, were broken down into their monomer sugars within a few months [\(Gunina and Kuzyakov](#page-16-31)  [2015\)](#page-16-31). The metabolic features of A. vitis strains may contribute to their long-lasting survival and their role in the grapevineassociated microbiome by producing various metabolites after consuming sugars.

<span id="page-13-5"></span>Sucrose supplementation resulted in the suppression of host growth by both VAR03-1 and Cab57. A study by [Liu et](#page-16-32) al. [\(2012\)](#page-16-32) in an aquatic ecosystem demonstrated that changes in nutrient availability favoring bacterial growth can shift interactions between aquatic algae and bacteria from commensalism to competition. This shift leads to a decrease in algal biomass, driven by increased bacterial proliferation and competition for nutrients. A similar depletion of nutrients by overgrown



bacteria may occur in our experimental setting. Alternatively, other bacterial-derived molecules besides AHLs, such as bacterial toxins, could contribute to this inhibition [\(Stroo et](#page-17-30) al. 1988, [Bolton et](#page-16-33) al. 1989).

<span id="page-14-4"></span><span id="page-14-1"></span><span id="page-14-0"></span>In our results, the *ArecA* mutation of VAR03-1 reduced its harmful activity to *Arabidopsis* in the presence of sucrose. Unlike Δ65 and Δ86, the *ΔrecA* mutant exhibited almost similar growth in liquid MS medium with only a slight reduction compared to the WT strain, but its inhibitory activity in the presence of sucrose was lower than that of the WT strain. This may be due to the decreased colonization (growth) in the surrounding areas of the roots. As colonies like bioflm on the root surface appeared to be increased, this may indicate a shift in bacterial habitat from a free-living to a sessile mode due to the loss of *recA*, as suggested by in vitro experiments. The effect of RecA on bioflm formation varies between bacterial species. For instance, the loss of *recA* leads to decreased bioflm formation in *Escherichia coli* [\(Beloin et](#page-16-34) al. 2004, [Recacha et](#page-17-31) al. 2019), *Streptococcus mutans* [\(Inagaki et](#page-16-35) al. 2009) and *Bacillus cereus* [\(Gao](#page-16-36)  et [al. 2020\)](#page-16-36), while it increases bioflm formation in *Acinetobacter baumannii* [\(Ching et](#page-16-37) al. 2024) and *P. aeruginosa* [\(Yahya et](#page-17-32) al. [2023\)](#page-17-32). In *Staphylococcus lugdunensis*, the bioflm formation of *A. vitis* may depend more on exopolysaccharide (EPS) rather than environmental DNA from spontaneously bursting cells via RecA activity [\(Ravaioli et](#page-17-21) al. 2020). The increased biofilm formation observed in the  $\triangle$ recA mutant of VAR03-1 could be due to an increase in EPS or a behavioral change. Our study suggests that the growth inhibitory activity caused by the increased population of VAR03-1 in the rhizosphere is likely linked more to the biological activity associated with its free-living style. Disturbances afecting persistence and stability in commensalism with host plants, such as sucrose supplementation, should provide clues to understanding the molecular mechanisms and biological signifcance underlying commensalism. For this purpose, simplifed and controllable experimental settings, alongside studies involving synthetic communities or soil systems, are crucial.

#### **Materials and Methods**

#### **Plant material and growth conditions**

Seeds were surface-sterilized using a 0.1% (v/v) sodium hypochlorite solution in a 1.5-ml tube, followed by shaking for 10 min at room temperature. The seeds were then rinsed seven times with sterile distilled water. During the last rinse, a portion of the water was retained to maintain seed submergence in the tube. Seeds were then stratifed under dark conditions at 4∘C for 3–4 d before being sown on plates containing half-strength MS agar [containing 0.1% (v/v) Gamborg vitamins and 0.8% (w/v) agar] supplemented with 1% sucrose. Plates were incubated in a growth chamber under long-day conditions (16 h photoperiod) at 22∘C for further experiments. *AtFAAH* knockout mutants were a generous gift from Professor Kent D. Chapman from the University of North Texas.

### **Bacterial strains and growth conditions**

<span id="page-14-6"></span>All WT strains of *A. vitis*, including an antagonistic strain VAR03-1 [\(Noutoshi](#page-17-8)  et [al. 2020b\)](#page-17-8), a pathogenic strain VAT03-9 (Ti) [\(Noutoshi et](#page-17-33) al. 2020c) and a non-pathogenic and non-antagonistic strain VAR06-30 [\(Noutoshi et](#page-17-34) al. 2020a), <span id="page-14-8"></span>and *P. protegens* Cab 57 [\(Takeuchi et](#page-17-28) al. 2014) were cultured in KB medium without antibiotics. For VAR03-1  $\triangle$ recA (Ishii et [al. 2024\)](#page-16-8), KB medium containing 30 μg/ml nalidixic acid was used. Prior to experiments, glycerol stock cultures were streak-inoculated onto KB agar with or without antibiotics and incubated at 27°C for 24 h for *A. vitis* strains and 12 h for *P. protegens* Cab57. The colonies were then transferred to KB liquid medium with or without antibiotics and incubated at 28∘C with shaking at 165 rpm for 18 h for *A. vitis* strains and 12 h for *P. protegens* Cab57.

## **Bacterial growth assay**

The bacterial culture was harvested by centrifugation  $(3,500 \times g, 10 \text{ min})$  and resuspended in 10 mM MgCl<sub>2</sub>. The bacterial suspension was then adjusted to an OD of 10 at 600 nm (OD<sub>600</sub>). Subsequently, 150  $\mu$ l of bacterial suspension was added to 15 ml of liquid MS [supplemented with 0.1% (v/v) Gamborg vitamins with or without sugars] (a final  $OD_{600}$  value of 0.1). Cultures were then incubated at 27°C (165 rpm), and OD<sub>600</sub> was monitored every 2 h for 14–16 h. For supplementation of organic acids, 150 μl of 20 mM stock solution was added to 15 ml of MS medium prior to transferring the bacterial suspension, resulting in a fnal organic acid concentration of 200 μM [\(Anderson et](#page-15-0) al. 2014).

#### <span id="page-14-9"></span><span id="page-14-7"></span><span id="page-14-3"></span><span id="page-14-2"></span>**Bacterial inoculation on Arabidopsis seedlings**

Bacterial inoculation was performed on square plates containing MS agar supplemented with 0.1% Gamborg vitamins and 0.8% agar, with or without sucrose or alternative sugars or organic acids. The bacterial suspension was then adjusted to an  $OD<sub>600</sub>$  value of 0.5. Fifty microliters of bacterial suspension was added to 50 ml of warm MS agar and poured onto a square plate (resulting in a final OD<sub>600</sub> value of 5 × 10<sup>−4</sup>, equivalent to approximately 10<sup>5</sup> c.f.u./ml). For mock treatment, 50  $\mu$ l of 10 mM MgCl $_2$  was used. After solidification, 5-day-old *Arabidopsis* seedlings were transferred to the square plate (8 seedlings/plate) and sealed with micropore tape. Two replicate plates were prepared for each treatment. The plates were arranged in a near-vertical orientation to facilitate root penetration into the agar. The plates were then kept in a growth chamber for 8-14 d until the roots almost touched the bottom of the plate. The photographs of the plates were taken using a mirrorless camera, and the PR length was measured using ImageJ software. Bacterial colonies around the roots were observed using a stereomicroscope. Finally, the shoots were separated from the roots and weighed.

In experiments with diferent initial concentrations of VAR03-1, the collected bacterial suspension was adjusted to  $OD_{600}$  values of 5, 0.5 and 0.05, resulting in final OD<sub>600</sub> concentrations of  $5 \times 10^{-2}$ ,  $5 \times 10^{-3}$  and  $5 \times 10^{-3}$ , respectively. Then, 500  $\mu$ l of the bacterial suspension was mixed with 50 ml of warm MS agar without sucrose and poured onto a square plate. For the control (mock), 500  $\mu$ l of 10 mM MgCl<sub>2</sub> was used.

## **Flg22 treatment for gene expression analysis**

<span id="page-14-5"></span>After a 3-day stratifcation period, sterile *Arabidopsis* seeds were germinated on MS agar plates. To minimize the potential efect of high sucrose on subsequent responses to fg22, seeds were not germinated on MS agar plates supplemented with 1% sucrose. Instead, they were germinated on MS agar plates with diferent sucrose concentrations to be tested (0, 0.1, 1, 10 and 25 mM). Five-day-old seedlings grown on MS agar with 1, 10 and 25 mM sucrose and 6-day-old seedlings grown on MS agar with 0 and 0.1 mM sucrose were selected for the experiment. This selection was made to standardize seedling size, as seedlings grown at lower sucrose concentrations tend to be smaller. Seedlings were then transferred to a square plate containing MS agar supplemented with  $0.5 \mu$ M fg22 or sterile water with the same sucrose concentration as their germination medium. The plates were then incubated in a growth chamber for 3d before RNA extraction.



## **Root colonization assay**

For root colonization assessment, a hydroponic culture system using a 12-well plate was used instead of a square plate agar system. This system allowed the evaluation of bacterial colonies both attached to the roots and free in the medium. The liquid MS medium was supplemented with a bacterial suspension to achieve a final OD<sub>600</sub> value of 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>. Five milliliters of this mixture was dispensed into each well. Sterile silicone rubber with slits, aligned with the position of each well in a row, was placed on top of each row. A 7-day-old *Arabidopsis* seedling was carefully positioned in the slit of each well, ensuring that the shoot protruded above the rubber while the roots were in contact with the medium below. This setup effectively sealed the surface of the well, leaving only the slit housing the seedling open, thus minimizing evaporation of medium. The plate was placed in a sterile, clear plastic box, sealed with micropore tape and incubated in a growth chamber. After 10–12 d of incubation, three or four representative seedlings from each treatment were selected for evaluation of root colonization. Roots were detached and transferred to a 2-ml tube. Roots were then washed twice with sterile water by vigorous pipetting and placed on flter paper to remove excess moisture before weighing. Roots were then transferred to a microtube containing 400 μl of sterile water and homogenized using a tissue homogenizer. An additional 600 μl of sterile water was added to create a 1,000 μl root suspension. Simultaneously, 1 ml of the medium was collected from the wells in which the selected seedlings were growing. Serial dilutions were then performed on both the root suspension samples and the medium from each seedling. Three 6-μl drops of each dilution were dispensed to three square plates containing KB agar. After allowing the drops to dry for approximately 3 min, the plates were sealed with micropore tape and incubated at 10°C for 3-7 d. The colonies that appeared on each drop were counted using a stereomicroscope.

## **Gene expression analysis**

Inoculated *Arabidopsis* seedlings were harvested from the square plates at the designated time points. Roots and shoots were collected in separate tubes. Due to the small size of the seedlings, composite samples of roots or shoots from fve to 15 seedlings were prepared in one tube. The tubes were immediately frozen in liquid nitrogen. RNA was extracted using the ISOSPIN Plant RNA kit (Nippon Gene, Tokyo, Japan), and cDNA was synthesized using the PrimeScript<sup>TM</sup> RT reagent kit with a gDNA eraser (Takara Bio, Kusatsu, Japan). Relative expression levels of *FRK1* and *PDF1.2* were quantifed using Luna Universal qPCR Master Mix (New England Biolabs, Ipswich, MA, USA) and the LightCycler 96 (Roche, Basel, Switzerland). *UBQ10* was selected as a housekeeping gene. Primers are listed in **[Supplementary Table S1](#page-15-1)**.

#### **Tn-mediated random mutagenesis**

The production of the VAR03-1 mutant population by Tns has been described previously (Ishii et [al. 2024\)](#page-16-8). A total of 112 out of about 200 mutants were mixed in MS agar containing 1% sucrose at a final OD<sub>600</sub> value of 5 × 10<sup>-4</sup>, and the mutants with relatively less efect on growth suppression of *Arabidopsis* seedlings were selected. The identification of the transposition site based on the plasmid rescue method was also described previously (Ishii et [al. 2024\)](#page-16-8).

# **Bioflm formation assay and free-living cell measurement**

<span id="page-15-4"></span>The biofilm formation assay was performed on a 96-well plate according to [Abarca-Grau et](#page-15-3) al. (2011) with some modifcations. Briefy, bacterial culture grown overnight in liquid adherence test medium (ATM) (containing 2 g/l mannitol) supplemented with biotin (2 mg/l) was adjusted to an  $OD<sub>600</sub>$  value of 0.04 in fresh liquid ATM medium. Subsequently, 200 μl of this bacterial suspension was dispensed into each well of a 96-well plate and incubated statically at 27∘C. After 6 d, the liquid bacterial culture was transferred to a new 96-well plate for OD<sub>595</sub> measurement of free-living (planktonic) cells. The original plate was then thoroughly rinsed three times with distilled water and air-dried for 45 min. Two hundred microliters of 0.1% crystal violet was added to each well and incubated for 45 min to stain sessile bacteria. The plates were then rinsed three times with distilled water and air-dried for 45 min. Two hundred microliters of 95% ethanol was added to each well, and 150 μl was transferred to a new 96-well plate. Biofilm formation was measured at OD<sub>595</sub>.

# **Supplementary Data**

<span id="page-15-1"></span>[Supplementary data](https://academic.oup.com/pcp/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/pcp/pcae091#supplementary-data) are available at *PCP* online.

## **Data Availability**

The data supporting the findings of this study are available within the article and its **[supplementary data](#page-15-1)**.

## **Funding**

Japan Society for the Promotion of Science (JSPS) KAK-ENHI (Grant-in-Aid for Challenging Research (Pioneering) JP20K20572 to Y.N.); Basic fund from Okayama University to Y.N.

#### **Acknowledgments**

Bacterial strains of *A. vitis* were kindly provided by Okayama Prefecture, Japan. *Pseudomonas protegens* Cab57 was obtained from the Genebank Project, NARO, Japan. *Escherichia coli* S17-1 λpir was obtained from the National BioResource Project *E. coli* at the National Institute of Genetics.

#### **Author Contributions**

Y.N. conceived of the study and designed the experiments. N.M.H., J.B. and M.W. performed all experiments. H.M., K.T., Y.I. and Y.N. provided equipment and facilities. N.M.H. and Y.N. drafted the manuscript, and N.M.H. and Y.N. revised and edited the draft manuscript. N.M.H., J.B., M.W., H.M., K.H., Y.I. and Y.N. contributed to the analyses, data interpretation and critical revision of the manuscript.

## **Disclosures**

The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

#### **References**

- <span id="page-15-3"></span>[Abarca-Grau, A.M., Penyalver, R., López, M.M.](#page-15-4) and [Marco-Noales, E.](#page-15-4) (2011) Pathogenic and non-pathogenic *Agrobacterium tumefaciens, A. rhizogenes* and *A. vitis* strains form bioflms on abiotic as well as on root surfaces. *Plant Pathol*. 60: 416–425.
- <span id="page-15-0"></span>[Anderson, J.C.,](#page-3-1) [Wan, Y.,](#page-3-1) [Kim, Y.M.,](#page-3-1) [Pasa-Tolic, L.,](#page-3-1) [Metz, T.O.](#page-3-1) and [Peck,](#page-3-1)  [S.C.](#page-3-1) (2014) Decreased abundance of type III secretion system inducing signals in *Arabidopsis mkp1* enhances resistance against *Pseudomonas syringae*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A*. 111: 6846–6851.
- <span id="page-15-2"></span>[Aranda, J., Bardina, C., Beceiro, A., Rumbo, S., Cabral, M.P., Barbé, J.,](#page-11-0) et al. (2011) *Acinetobacter baumannii* RecA protein in repair of DNA damage, antimicrobial resistance, general stress response, and virulence. *J. Bacteriol*. 193: 3740–3747.



- <span id="page-16-11"></span>[Badri, D.V., Quintana, N., El Kassis, E.G.](#page-1-0) [Kim, H.K., Choi, Y.H., Sugiyama, A.,](#page-1-0) et al. (2009) An ABC transporter mutation alters root exudation of phytochemicals that provoke an overhaul of natural soil microbiota. *Plant Physiol*. 151: 2006–2017.
- <span id="page-16-2"></span>[Bell, C.A., Magkourilou, E., Urwin, P.E.](#page-0-3) and [Field, K.J.](#page-0-3) (2021) The influence of competing root symbionts on below-ground plant resource allocation. *Ecol. Evol*. 11: 2997–3003.
- <span id="page-16-34"></span>[Beloin, C., Valle, J., Latour-Lambert, P., Faure, P., Kzreminski, M., Balestrino,](#page-14-0)  [D.,](#page-14-0) et al. (2004) Global impact of mature bioflm lifestyle on *Escherichia coli* K-12 gene expression. *Mol. Microbiol*. 51: 659–674.
- <span id="page-16-17"></span>[Boller, T.](#page-7-1) and [Felix, G.](#page-7-1) (2009) A renaissance of elicitors: perception of microbe-associated molecular patterns and danger signals by patternrecognition receptors. *Annu. Rev. Plant Biol*. 60: 379–407.
- <span id="page-16-33"></span>[Bolton, H., Elliott, L.F., Gurusiddaiah, S.](#page-14-1) and [Fredrickson, J.K.](#page-14-1) (1989) Characterization of a toxin produced by a rhizobacterial *Pseudomonas* sp. that inhibits wheat growth. *Plant Soil* 114: 279–287.
- <span id="page-16-30"></span>[Burr, T.J., Reid, C.L., Yoshimura, M., Momol, E.A. a](#page-13-0)nd [Bazzi, C.](#page-13-0) (1995) Survival and tumorigenicity of *Agrobacterium vitis* in living and decaying grape roots and canes in soil. *Plant Dis*. 79: 677–682.
- <span id="page-16-12"></span>[Chaparro, J.M.,](#page-1-1) [Badri, D.V., Bakker, M.G., Sugiyama, A.,](#page-1-1) [Manter, D.K.](#page-1-1) and [Vivanco, J.M.](#page-1-1) (2013) Root exudation of phytochemicals in *Arabidopsis* follows specifc patterns that are developmentally programmed and correlate with soil microbial functions. *PLoS One* 8: e55731.
- <span id="page-16-1"></span>[Chen, H.,](#page-0-4) [Rafaele, S.](#page-0-4) and [Dong, S.](#page-0-4) (2021) Silent control: microbial plant pathogens evade host immunity without coding sequence changes. *FEMS Microbiol. Rev*. 45: fuab002.
- <span id="page-16-37"></span>[Ching, C.,](#page-14-2) [Brychcy, M.,](#page-14-2) [Nguyen, B.,](#page-14-2) [Muller, P., Pearson, A.R.,](#page-14-2) [Downs, M.,](#page-14-2) et al. (2024) RecA levels modulate bioflm development in *Acinetobacter baumannii*. *Mol. Microbiol*. 121: 196–212.
- <span id="page-16-3"></span>[Colaianni, N.R., Parys, K., Lee, H.S., Conway, J.M., Kim, N.H., Edelbacher, N.,](#page-0-5) et al. (2021) A complex immune response to fagellin epitope variation in commensal communities. *Cell Host Microbe* 29: 635–649.
- <span id="page-16-16"></span>[Cole, B.J., Feltcher, M.E., Waters, R.J., Wetmore, K.M., Mucyn, T.S., Ryan, E.M.,](#page-6-0) et al. (2017) Genome-wide identifcation of bacterial plant colonization genes. *PLoS Biol*. 15: e2002860.
- <span id="page-16-24"></span>[Corral, J.,](#page-11-1) [Pérez-Varela, M.,](#page-11-1) [Barbé, J.](#page-11-1) and [Aranda, J.](#page-11-1) (2020) Direct interaction between RecA and a CheW-like protein is required for surfaceassociated motility, chemotaxis and the full virulence of *Acinetobacter baumannii* strain ATCC 17978. *Virulence* 11: 315–326.
- <span id="page-16-28"></span>[Couillerot, O.,](#page-13-1) [Prigent-Combaret, C.,](#page-13-1) [Caballero-Mellado, J.](#page-13-1) and [Moënne-](#page-13-1)[Loccoz, Y.](#page-13-1) (2009) *Pseudomonas fuorescens* and closely-related fuorescent pseudomonads as biocontrol agents of soil-borne phytopathogens. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol*. 48: 505–512.
- <span id="page-16-13"></span>[Cowles, J.R., Evans, H.J.](#page-6-1) and [Russell, S.A.](#page-6-1) (1969) B12 coenzyme-dependent ribonucleotide reductase in *Rhizobium* species and the efects of cobalt defciency on the activity of the enzyme. *J. Bacteriol*. 97: 1460–1465.
- <span id="page-16-29"></span>[Défago, G., Berling, C.H., Burger, U., Haas, D., Kahr, G., Keel, C.,](#page-13-2) et al. (1990) Suppression of black root rot of tobacco and other root diseases by strains of *Pseudomonas fuorescens*: potential applications and mechanisms. [Scott P.R..](#page-13-2) *In Biological Control of Soil-Borne Plant Pathogens.*. pp. 93–108. CAB International, Oxon, UK.
- <span id="page-16-0"></span>[Drew, G.C., Stevens, E.J.](#page-0-6) and [King, K.C.](#page-0-6) (2021) Microbial evolution and transitions along the parasite–mutualist continuum. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol*. 19: 623–638.
- <span id="page-16-15"></span>[Ernst, C.M.](#page-6-2) and [Peschel, A.](#page-6-2) (2011) Broad-spectrum antimicrobial peptide resistance by MprF-mediated aminoacylation and fipping of phospholipids. *Mol. Microbiol*. 80: 290–299.
- <span id="page-16-23"></span>[Fuchs, S., Mühldorfer, I., Donohue-Rolfe, A., Kerényi, M., Emödy, L., Alexiev,](#page-11-2)  [R.,](#page-11-2) et al. (1999) Infuence of RecA on in vivo virulence and Shiga toxin 2 production in *Escherichia coli* pathogens. *Microb. Pathog*. 27: 13–23.
- <span id="page-16-36"></span>[Gao, T., Ding, M.](#page-14-3) and [Wang, Q.](#page-14-3) (2020) The recA gene is crucial to mediate colonization of *Bacillus cereus* 905 on wheat roots. *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol*. **104**: 9251–9265.
- <span id="page-16-25"></span>[Garrido-Oter, R., Nakano, R.T., Dombrowski, N., Ma, K.-W., McHardy, A.C.,](#page-12-1) [Schulze-Lefert, P.](#page-12-1) (2018) Modular traits of the Rhizobiales root microbiota and their evolutionary relationship with symbiotic Rhizobia. *Cell Host Microbe* 24: 155–167.
- <span id="page-16-27"></span>[Gu, Y.,](#page-13-3) [Wei, Z.,](#page-13-3) [Wang, X.,](#page-13-3) [Friman, V.P.,](#page-13-3) [Huang, J.,](#page-13-3) [Wang, X.,](#page-13-3) et al. (2016) Pathogen invasion indirectly changes the composition of soil microbiome via shifts in root exudation profle. *Biol. Fertil. Soils* 52: 997–1005.
- <span id="page-16-31"></span>[Gunina, A.](#page-13-4) and [Kuzyakov, Y.](#page-13-4) (2015) Sugars in soil and sweets for microorganisms: review of origin, content, composition and fate. *Soil Biol. Biochem*. 90: 87–100.
- <span id="page-16-35"></span>[Inagaki, S., Matsumoto-Nakano, M., Fujita, K., Nagayama, K., Funao, J.](#page-14-4) and [Ooshima, T.](#page-14-4) (2009) Efects of recombinase A defciency on bioflm formation by *Streptococcus mutans*. *Oral. Microbiol. Immunol*. 24: 104–108.
- <span id="page-16-8"></span>[Ishii, T., Tsuchida, N., Hemelda, N.M., Saito, K., Bao, J., Watanabe, M.,](#page-1-2) et al. (2024) Rhizoviticin is an alphaproteobacterial tailocin that mediates biocontrol of grapevine crown gall disease. *ISME J*. 18: wrad003.
- <span id="page-16-21"></span>[Kaushik, V., Tiwari, M.](#page-11-3) and [Tiwari, V.](#page-11-3) (2022) Interaction of RecA mediated SOS response with bacterial persistence, bioflm formation, and host response. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol*. 217: 931–943.
- <span id="page-16-9"></span>[Kawaguchi, A., Inoue, K.](#page-1-3) and [Ichinose, Y.](#page-1-3) (2008) Biological control of crown gall of grapevine, rose, and tomato by nonpathogenic *Agrobacterium* vitis strain VAR03-1. *Phytopathology* 98: 1218–1225.
- <span id="page-16-5"></span>[Kawaguchi, A.,](#page-1-4) [Inoue, K.](#page-1-4) and [Nasu, H.](#page-1-4) (2005) Inhibition of crown gall formation by *Agrobacterium radiobacter* biovar 3 strains isolated from grapevine. *J. Gen. Plant Pathol*. 71: 422–430.
- <span id="page-16-6"></span>[Kawaguchi, A., Inoue, K.](#page-1-5) and [Nasu, H.](#page-1-5) (2007) Biological control of grapevine crown gall by nonpathogenic *Agrobacterium vitis* strain VAR03-1. *J. Gen. Plant Pathol*. 73: 133–138.
- <span id="page-16-10"></span>[Kawaguchi, A., Kondo, K.-I.](#page-1-6) and [Inoue, K.](#page-1-6) (2012) Biological control of apple crown gall by nonpathogenic *Rhizobium vitis* strain VAR03-1. *J. Gen. Plant Pathol*. 78: 287–293.
- <span id="page-16-18"></span>[Kunze, G., Zipfel, C., Robatzek, S., Niehaus, K., Boller, T.](#page-7-2) and [Felix, G.](#page-7-2) (2004) The N terminus of bacterial elongation factor Tu elicits innate immunity in *Arabidopsis* plants. *Plant Cell* 16: 3496–3507.
- <span id="page-16-7"></span>Kuzmanović, N., [Puławska, J.,](#page-1-7) [Hao, L.](#page-1-7) and [Burr, T.J.](#page-1-7) (2018) The ecology of *Agrobacterium vitis* and management of crown gall disease in vineyards. *Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol*. 418: 15–53.
- <span id="page-16-14"></span>[Lee, Y., Haapanen, O., Altmeyer, A., Holden, M.R., Kühlbrandt, W., Sharma,](#page-6-3)  [V.,](#page-6-3) et al. (2022) Ion transfer mechanisms in Mrp-type antiporters from high resolution cryoEM and molecular dynamics simulations. *Nat. Commun*. 13: 6091.
- <span id="page-16-20"></span>[Li, Y., Gronquist, M.R., Hao, G., Holden, M.R., Eberhard, A., Scott, R.A.,](#page-11-4) et al. (2006) Chromosome and plasmid-encoded *N*-acyl homoserine lactones produced by *Agrobacterium vitis* wildtype and mutants that difer in their interactions with grape and tobacco. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol*. 67: 284–290.
- <span id="page-16-32"></span>[Liu, H.,](#page-13-5) [Zhou, Y.,](#page-13-5) [Xiao, W.,](#page-13-5) [Ji, L.,](#page-13-5) [Cao, X.](#page-13-5) and [Song, C.](#page-13-5) (2012) Shifting nutrient-mediated interactions between algae and bacteria in a microcosm: evidence from alkaline phosphatase assay. *Microbiol. Res*. 167: 292–298.
- <span id="page-16-4"></span>[Loo, E.P.-I., Durán, P., Pang, T.Y., Westhof, P., Deng, C., Durán, C.,](#page-1-8) et al. (2024) Sugar transporters spatially organize microbiota colonization along the longitudinal root axis of *Arabidopsis*. *Cell Host Microbe* 32: 1–14.
- <span id="page-16-26"></span>[Lopes, L.D., Wang, P., Futrell, S.L., Schachtman, D.P.](#page-13-6) and [Alexandre, G.](#page-13-6) (2022) Sugars and jasmonic acid concentration in root exudates afect maize rhizosphere bacterial communities. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol*. 88: 1–16.
- <span id="page-16-19"></span>[Lu, D.,](#page-7-3) [Wu, S.,](#page-7-3) [Gao, X.,](#page-7-3) [Zhang, Y., Shan, L.](#page-7-3) and [He, P.](#page-7-3) (2010) A receptorlike cytoplasmic kinase, BIK1, associates with a flagellin receptor complex to initiate plant innate immunity. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A*. 107: 496–501.
- <span id="page-16-22"></span>[Martínez, S.,](#page-11-5) [Martínez-Salazar, J.,](#page-11-5) [Camas, A.,](#page-11-5) [Sánchez, R.](#page-11-5) and [Soberón-](#page-11-5)[Chávez, G.](#page-11-5) (1997) Evaluation of the role of RecA protein in plant virulence with *recA* mutants of *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. campestris. *Mol. Plant Microbe Interact*. **10**: 911–916.



<span id="page-17-0"></span>[Mathis, K.A.](#page-0-7) and [Bronstein, J.L.](#page-0-7) (2020) Our current understanding of commensalism. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst*. 51: 167–189.

- <span id="page-17-6"></span>[Matilla, M.A.,](#page-1-9) [Espinosa-Urgel, M.,](#page-1-9) [Rodríguez-Herva, J.J.,](#page-1-9) [Ramos, J.L.](#page-1-9) and [Ramos-González, M.I.](#page-1-9) (2007) Genomic analysis reveals the major driving forces of bacterial life in the rhizosphere. *Genome Biol*. 8: R179.
- <span id="page-17-24"></span>[McLaughlin, S., Zhalnina, K.,](#page-13-7) [Kosina, S., Northen, T.R.](#page-13-7) and [Sasse, J.](#page-13-7) (2023) The core metabolome and root exudation dynamics of three phylogenetically distinct plant species. *Nat. Commun*. 14: 1649.
- <span id="page-17-3"></span>[Ngou, B.P.M., Ding, P.](#page-0-8) and [Jones, J.D.G.](#page-0-8) (2022) Thirty years of resistance: zigzag through the plant immune system. *Plant Cell* 34: 1447–1478.
- <span id="page-17-7"></span>[Nogales, J.,](#page-1-10) [Palsson, B.](#page-1-10) and [Tiele, I.](#page-1-10) (2008) A genome-scale metabolic reconstruction of *Pseudomonas putida* KT2440: iJN746 as a cell factory. *BMC Syst. Biol*. 2: 79.
- <span id="page-17-34"></span>[Noutoshi, Y., Toyoda, A., Ishii, T., Saito, K., Watanabe, M.](#page-14-5) and [Kawaguchi, A.](#page-14-5) (2020a) Complete genome sequence data of nonpathogenic and nonantagonistic strain of *Rhizobium vitis* VAR06-30 isolated from grapevine rhizosphere. *Mol. Plant Microbe Interact*. 33: 1283–1285.
- <span id="page-17-8"></span>[Noutoshi, Y.,](#page-1-11) [Toyoda, A.,](#page-1-11) [Ishii, T.,](#page-1-11) [Saito, K.,](#page-1-11) [Watanabe, M.](#page-1-11) and [Kawaguchi, A.](#page-1-11) (2020b) Complete genome sequence data of nonpathogenic strain *Rhizobium vitis* VAR03-1, a biological control agent for grapevine crown gall disease. *Mol. Plant Microbe Interact*. 33: 1451–1453.
- <span id="page-17-33"></span>[Noutoshi, Y.,](#page-14-6) [Toyoda, A., Ishii, T., Saito, K., Watanabe, M.](#page-14-6) and [Kawaguchi,](#page-14-6)  [A.](#page-14-6) (2020c) Complete genome sequence data of tumorigenic *Rhizobium vitis* strain VAT03-9, a causal agent of grapevine crown gall disease. *Mol. Plant Microbe Interact*. 33: 1280–1282.
- <span id="page-17-13"></span>[Okada, K., Kubota, Y., Hirase, T., Otani, K., Goh, T., Hiruma, K.,](#page-7-4) et al. (2021) Uncoupling root hair formation and defence activation from growth inhibition in response to damage-associated Pep peptides in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *New Phytol*. 229: 2844–2858.
- <span id="page-17-16"></span>[Ortíz-Castro, R., Martínez-Trujillo, M.](#page-11-6) and [López-Bucio, J.](#page-11-6) (2008) *N*-acyl-Lhomoserine lactones: a class of bacterial quorum-sensing signals alter post-embryonic root development in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant Cell Environ*. 31: 1497–1509.
- <span id="page-17-17"></span>[Palmer, A.G.,](#page-11-7) [Senechal, A.C., Mukherjee, A., Ané, J.M.](#page-11-7) and [Blackwell, H.E.](#page-11-7) (2014) Plant responses to bacterial *N*-acyl L-homoserine lactones are dependent on enzymatic degradation to L-homoserine. *ACS Chem. Biol*. 9: 1834–1845.
- <span id="page-17-20"></span>[Pearson, J.P., Van Delden, C.](#page-11-8) and [Iglewski, B.H.](#page-11-8) (1999) Active efflux and diffusion are involved in transport of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* cell-to-cell signals. *J. Bacteriol*. 181: 1203–1210.
- <span id="page-17-27"></span>[Pfender, W.F., Kraus, J.](#page-13-8) and [Loper, J.E.](#page-13-8) (1993) A genomic region from *Pseudomonas fuorescens* Pf-5 required for pyrrolnitrin production and inhibition of *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis* in wheat straw. *Phytopathology* 83: 1223–1228.
- <span id="page-17-21"></span>[Ravaioli, S.,](#page-11-9) [Campoccia, D.,](#page-11-9) [Speziale, P.,](#page-11-9) [Pietrocola, G., Zatorska, B.,](#page-11-9) [Maso,](#page-11-9)  [A.,](#page-11-9) et al. (2020) Various bioflm matrices of the emerging pathogen *Staphylococcus lugdunensis*: exopolysaccharides, proteins, eDNA and their correlation with bioflm mass. *Biofouling* 36: 86–100.
- <span id="page-17-31"></span>[Recacha, E., Machuca, J., Díaz-Díaz, S., García-Duque, A., Ramos-Guelfo, M.,](#page-14-7) [Docobo-Pérez, F.,](#page-14-7) et al. (2019) Suppression of the SOS response modifes spatiotemporal evolution, post-antibiotic effect, bacterial fitness and bioflm formation in quinolone-resistant *Escherichia coli*. *J. Antimicrob. Chemother*. 74: 66–73.
- <span id="page-17-14"></span>[Roux, M.,](#page-7-5) [Schwessinger, B.,](#page-7-5) [Albrecht, C., Chinchilla, D.,](#page-7-5) [Jones, A.,](#page-7-5) [Holton,](#page-7-5)  [N.,](#page-7-5) et al. (2011) The *Arabidopsis* leucine-rich repeat receptor-like kinases BAK1/SERK3 and BKK1/SERK4 are required for innate immunity to hemibiotrophic and biotrophic pathogens. *Plant Cell* 23: 2440–2455.
- <span id="page-17-19"></span>[Savka, M.A.,](#page-11-10) [Le, P.T.](#page-11-10) and [Burr, T.J.](#page-11-10) (2011) LasR receptor for detection of long-chain quorum-sensing signals: identifcation of *N*-acyl-homoserine lactones encoded by the *avsI* locus of *Agrobacterium vitis*. *Curr. Microbiol*. 62: 101–110.
- <span id="page-17-25"></span>[Shimasaki, T.,](#page-13-9) [Masuda, S.,](#page-13-9) [Garrido-Oter, R.,](#page-13-9) [Kawasaki, T.,](#page-13-9) [Aoki, Y.,](#page-13-9) [Shi](#page-13-9)[bata, A.,](#page-13-9) et al. (2021) Tobacco root endophytic arthrobacter harbors genomic features enabling the catabolism of host-specifc plant specialized metabolites. *mBio* 12: e00846–21.
- <span id="page-17-12"></span>[Sivakumar, R.,](#page-6-4) [Ranjani, J.,](#page-6-4) [Vishnu, U.S.,](#page-6-4) [Jayashree, S.,](#page-6-4) [Lozano, G.L.,](#page-6-4) [Miles,](#page-6-4)  [J.,](#page-6-4) et al. (2019) Evaluation of INSeq to identify genes essential for *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* PGPR2 corn root colonization. *G3* 9: 651–661.
- <span id="page-17-11"></span>[Sohlenkamp, C.,](#page-6-5) [Galindo-Lagunas, K.A.,](#page-6-5) [Guan, Z., Vinuesa, P., Robinson,](#page-6-5)  [S.,](#page-6-5) Thomas-Oates, J., et al. (2007) The lipid lysyl-phosphatidylglycerol is present in membranes of *Rhizobium tropici* CIAT899 and confers increased resistance to polymyxin B under acidic growth conditions. *Mol. Plant Microbe Interact*. 20: 1421–1430.
- <span id="page-17-10"></span>[Song, D., Jiao, H.](#page-6-6) and [Liu, A.](#page-6-6) (2021) Phospholipid translocation captured in a bifunctional membrane protein MprF. *Nat. Commun*. 12: 2927.
- <span id="page-17-9"></span>[Song, M., Zhang, X., Yang, J., Gao, C., Wei, Y., Chen, S.,](#page-1-12) et al. (2022) *Arabidopsis* plants engineered for high root sugar secretion enhance the diversity of soil microorganisms. *Biotechnol. J*. 17: 2100638.
- <span id="page-17-30"></span>[Stroo, H.F., Elliott, L.F.](#page-14-8) and [Papendick, R.I.](#page-14-8) (1988) Growth, survival and toxin production of root-inhibitory pseudomonads on crop residues. *Soil Biol. Biochem*. 20: 201–207.
- <span id="page-17-28"></span>[Takeuchi, K., Noda, N.](#page-13-10) and [Someya, N.](#page-13-10) (2014) Complete genome sequence of the biocontrol strain *Pseudomonas protegens* Cab57 discovered in Japan reveals strain-specifc diversity of this species. *PLoS One* 9: e93683.
- <span id="page-17-2"></span>[Teixeira, P.J.P.L., Colaianni, N.R., Law, T.F., Conway, J.M., Gilbert, S., Li, H.,](#page-0-9) et al. (2021) Specifc modulation of the root immune system by a community of commensal bacteria. *Pro. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A*. 118: e2100678118.
- <span id="page-17-22"></span>[Turnbull, L., Toyofuku, M., Hynen, A.L., Kurosawa, M., Pessi, G., Petty, N.K.,](#page-11-11) et al. (2016) Explosive cell lysis as a mechanism for the biogenesis of bacterial membrane vesicles and bioflms. *Nat. Commun*. 7: 11220.
- <span id="page-17-15"></span>[Verstraeten, N.,](#page-11-12) [Braeken, K.,](#page-11-12) [Debkumari, B.,](#page-11-12) [Fauvart, M.,](#page-11-12) [Fransaer, J.,](#page-11-12) [Vermant, J.,](#page-11-12) et al. (2008) Living on a surface: swarming and bioflm formation. *Trends Microbiol*. 16: 496–506.
- <span id="page-17-29"></span>[Wang, N.R., Wiesmann, C.L., Melnyk, R.A., Hossain, S.S., Chi, M.-H., Martens,](#page-13-11)  [K.,](#page-13-11) et al. (2022) Commensal *Pseudomonas fuorescens* strains protect *Arabidopsis* from closely related *Pseudomonas pathogens* in a colonizationdependent manner. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol*. 13: e02892–21.
- <span id="page-17-18"></span>[Wang, Y.,](#page-11-13) [Zhang, L.,](#page-11-13) [Li, J.,](#page-11-13) [Wang, J.](#page-11-13) and [Wang, H.](#page-11-13) (2008) The quorumsensing system AvsR-AvsI regulates both long-chain and short-chain acyl-homoserine lactones in *Agrobacterium vitis* E26. *Antonie Van Leeuwenhoek*. 93: 267–273.
- <span id="page-17-5"></span>[Wei, S., Jacquiod, S., Philippot, L., Blouin, M.](#page-1-13) an[d Sørensen, S.J.](#page-1-13) (2021) Spatial analysis of the root system coupled to microbial community inoculation shed light on rhizosphere bacterial community assembly. *Biol. Fertil. Soil*. 57: 973–989.
- <span id="page-17-4"></span>[Wippel, K.,](#page-1-14) [Tao, K.,](#page-1-14) [Niu, Y.,](#page-1-14) [Zgadzaj, R.,](#page-1-14) [Kiel, N.,](#page-1-14) [Guan, R.,](#page-1-14) et al. (2021) Host preference and invasiveness of commensal bacteria in the lotus and *Arabidopsis* root microbiota. *Nat. Microbiol*. 6: 1150–1162.
- <span id="page-17-23"></span>[Wu, M.,](#page-11-14) [Shan, W.,](#page-11-14) [Zhao, G.P.](#page-11-14) and [Lyu, L.D.](#page-11-14) (2022)  $H_2O_2$  concentrationdependent kinetics of gene expression: linking the intensity of oxidative stress and mycobacterial physiological adaptation. *Emerg. Microbes Infect*. 11: 573–584.
- <span id="page-17-32"></span>[Yahya, A.H.,](#page-14-9) [Harston, S.R.,](#page-14-9) [Colton, W.L.,](#page-14-9) [Cabeen, M.T.](#page-14-9) and [Goldberg, J.B.](#page-14-9) (2023) Distinct screening approaches uncover PA14\_36820 and RecA as negative regulators of bioflm phenotypes in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* PA14. *Microbiol. Spectr*. 11: e0377422.
- <span id="page-17-1"></span>[Yu, K.,](#page-0-10) [Liu, Y.,](#page-0-10) [Tichelaar, R.,](#page-0-10) [Savant, N.,](#page-0-10) [Lagendijk, E.,](#page-0-10) [van Kuijk, S.J.L.,](#page-0-10) et al. (2019) Rhizosphere-associated *Pseudomonas* suppress local root immune responses by gluconic acid-mediated lowering of environmental pH. *Curr. Biol*. 29: 3913–3920.
- <span id="page-17-26"></span>[Zhou, Y.,](#page-13-12) [Zhao, D.,](#page-13-12) [Duan, Y.,](#page-13-12) [Chen, L.,](#page-13-12) [Fan, H.,](#page-13-12) [Wang, Y.,](#page-13-12) et al. (2023) AtSWEET1 negatively regulates plant susceptibility to root-knot nematode disease. *Front. Plant Sci*. 14: 1010348.

Plant Cell Physiol. 00(00): 1–18 (2024) doi:https://doi.org/10.1093/pcp/pcae091, Advance Access publication on 24 August 2024, available online at https://academic.oup.com/pcp

© The Author(s) 2024. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of Japanese Society of Plant Physiologists.

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License [\(https://creativecommons.org/licenses/](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) [by-nc/4.0/\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. For commercial re-use, please contact reprints@oup.com for reprints and translation rights for reprints. All other permissions can be obtained through our RightsLink service via the Permissions link on the article page on our site–for further information please contact journals.permissions@oup.com.